

# Corruption and Human Trafficking: A Holistic Approach

Shahrzad Fouladvand  
University of Sussex

## Introduction

The relationship between human trafficking and corruption, previously considered scarcely worthy of study, has come to be better and better understood over the past two decades, as fresh evidence has appeared. Looking back, it seems extraordinary that the Palermo Protocol on Trafficking of 2000<sup>1</sup> made no reference whatsoever to the role played by corruption and the US *Victims of Trafficking and Violence Protection Act* of the same year, suggested merely that traffickers are “often aided by official corruption”.<sup>2</sup> By 2006, however the *Organisation for Security and Co-operation in Europe* was confident enough to suggest “a very strong correlation between trafficking and corruption ... which flourishes in part through the corruption of officials” (Holmes 2005, p.83). But it was not until 2008 that it was finally accepted that corruption was a “necessary precondition” for trafficking (Demas 2008, p.211) and shortly afterwards Studnicka showed that traffickers of people in Brazil were “dependent” on corruption (2010, p.30). Subsequent studies have gone even further, with Uddin identifying corruption as an “underlying root cause” (2014, p.18) and the International Bar Association maintaining in 2016 that corruption facilitates “every aspect of trafficking” (2016, p.38).

Clearly any attempt to explore this relationship in detail presents multiple challenges to researchers (Holmes 2005, pp.83-4; Studnicka 2010, p.31). As a result, much of the earlier work relied on transnational multivariate analysis aimed at correlating, for example, the Transparency International Corruption Perceptions Index with the US TIP Reports and similar data (Lyday 2001; Bales 2005; Zhang and Pineda 2008; Van Dijk and Klerx-Van Mierlo 2011). Since then, the role of corruption in the facilitation of human trafficking has been analysed in a growing number of national and regional studies, based on interviews and other local qualitative and quantitative data. These include work on Nigeria (Agbu 2003), Africa (Demas 2008), Brazil (Studnicka 2010), Thailand (Sakdiyakorn and Vichitrananda 2010; OECD 2016, pp.79-102), South Asia (Uddin 2014) and the Philippines (OECD 2016, pp.51-78). This growing body of scholarship demonstrates very clearly the importance of viewing these related offences as part of a close and synergetic relationship.

The research has also exposed more clearly the corruption methodologies used by traffickers and others. Holmes has argued that the involvement of corrupt officials and facilitators is either “direct” (directing or consciously participating in trafficking organisations) or “indirect” (using trafficked persons, sabotaging investigations or anti-trafficking legislation) (2005, p.86). The international Bar Association Report in 2016 also identified four distinct ways in which the corruption of officials and others assists traffickers. These were by helping to ensure the invisibility of their activities, ensuring impunity for traffickers, facilitating trafficking circuits and increasing the likelihood of re-victimisation (2016, p.16). For Holmes, the collusion of corrupt officials with traffickers increased the isolation, subordination and terror of trafficking victims, resulting in their “triple victimisation” (2005). Research has also revealed the broad range of individuals who have been engaged in corrupt practices with or

---

<sup>1</sup> Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons Especially Women and Children, supplementing the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime. General Assembly Motion 55/25 of 15 November 2000.

<sup>2</sup> 48 (Victims of Trafficking and Violence Protection Act, Pub. L. No. 106-386, § 102(b)(8) (2000)).

on behalf of traffickers. Three modalities of trafficking-related corruption were identified by the International Bar Association, which included traffickers themselves, facilitators who assisted in the recruitment and transport of victims and the production of false documentation and “facilitators of impunity” who protected traffickers from discovery or prosecution (2016, pp.19-38). Although by far the largest target for corruption is the police (*ibid.*, p.16; Jonsson 2018), those also involved included customs, immigration and banking officials (Agbu 2003, p.8), prosecutors (Holmes 2005, p.87-94), the military, including UN forces (Vandenberg 2002, p.326) as well as NGOs and members of civil society more generally (UNODC 2011, p.6). Put simply, the costs of corrupting officials has now become the largest expenditure item for traffickers in people (OECD 2016, p.34).

The aim of this chapter is to attempt to explain the rise to prominence of the human trafficking/corruption nexus, first in practice, in the light of the research mentioned above and then in terms of the debates in both these fields as well as in the criminological literature. The chapter will conclude by reviewing the implications of this new work for our approach to detecting, preventing and prosecuting these linked offences.

## 1. Human trafficking and corruption in practice

There is insufficient space here to elaborate the full range of trafficking activities which are facilitated by corruption, so a very brief review must suffice. They will be addressed at each stage in the trafficking process in sequence, starting with police and military, marriage and travel agencies, immigration officials, court officials including prosecutors and judges, employers, NGOs and banks and other financial institutions involved in laundering funds.

The results of a 2009 UNODC survey revealed that law enforcement officials (including police, border control, immigration, and customs officials) are considered to be those most likely to participate in trafficking-related corruption (UNODC 2011, p.9). Police officers in many states facilitate trafficking by active involvement in a variety of ways including ignoring red flags, protecting traffickers and their interests, refusing to accept complaints about trafficking and obstructing investigations (*ibid.*, pp.23-29). They may receive bribes from criminal organisations involved in human trafficking to leak information regarding ongoing police operations or to obstruct investigations (Gounev and Ruggiero 2012, p.81). Law enforcement officials can also provide training and know-how to traffickers. In Albania, for example, a number of former Albanian security agents recruited into one human trafficking organisation allegedly trained the organisation’s members in ‘intelligence’ techniques, helping the criminal network create and operate internal secret communications (Leman and Janssens 2012). In some cases the police have committed funds to investing in trafficking (Sakdiyakorn and Vichitrananda 2010, p.63). Corrupt marriage and travel agencies have also aided traffickers in their business operations (OECD 2015). For example, in Russia marriage agencies played an important role in recruiting women for sexual exploitation (Hughes 2004). The traffickers operate in travel agencies, with each agency specializing in one particular country where trafficked women are sent (*ibid.*, p.9). The involvement of fraudulent trade unions as a cover to recruit migrant workers for a trafficking operation has also been reported in Eastern Europe (UNODC 2009, p. 17).

There is widespread evidence of corrupt practices by immigration officials facilitating trafficking, including issuing falsified papers or permitting undocumented departures or arrivals. According to a report prepared for the UK Home Office:

“In some cases, the corruption was not as obvious as the payment of money for services rendered, but was more subtle – [it had] to do with longstanding relationships of mutual benefit, such as the exchange favours among people in ‘useful positions’ ...”( cited in UNODC 2011, p.12)

Criminal justice actors, including judges and other judicial officers, have also been implicated in trafficking-related corruption by accepting bribes from traffickers to delay cases or make them disappear or by solicited bribes from trafficking victims to make cases move forward (Uddin 2014, pp.23-25). Social network sites are widely used to corrupt members of the judiciary and secure access to them ‘from the outside’. Through social networks formed around Masonic lodges or local political networks, traffickers have exploited the opportunity to contact members of the judiciary in secretive settings away from the public view (CSD 2010, p.108).

The corruption of employers is also essential for trafficking-related activities. Corruption fuels the exploitative practices of employers to whom cheap labour means greater profit. This is particularly so for employers who have paid fees to the trafficking brokers and bribes to others (Sakdiyakorn and Vichitrananda 2010, p. 61). Employers are able to bribe law enforcement officials to ignore workplace offences. Some employers use corrupt police also to help exert control over trafficked employees through a combination of physical abuse and threats of arrest and deportation. Charges made against traffickers or the employers involved may be dropped when those employers are able to bribe enforcement officials (Richards, 2004). While existing industries and companies listed can be corruption targets, they could also be established for this purpose (CSD 2010, p, 114). Criminals might corrupt an employee of a private company mainly to facilitate their criminal activities but also to launder profits from other offences (CSD 2010, p, 114).

Corruption within civil society and the private sector in relation to trafficking (UNODC 2009, p. 17) is also widespread. During the last decade, large amounts of money have been given to civil society organisations to establish projects to assist victims of trafficking. Unfortunately, there is evidence that some of these funds were used for private gain or actually to support trafficking activities (UNODC 2009, p. 17). Finally, and most importantly, criminal organisations cannot operate exclusively in a criminal environment without relying on legitimate or semi-legitimate companies to launder proceeds (Arsovska and Janssens 2009, p. 202). The collusion of bank officials is essential for the operation of successful money laundering schemes. Launderers have developed schemes whereby bank complicity is either difficult to prove or carried on through unregulated off-shore companies, shell companies, trusts and foundations (CSD 2010, p, 117).

The next brief review of the leading debates in the two areas demonstrates the extent of the similarities and overlaps between them and suggests the need for a more holistic and connected approach to them both. In the following section it will be argued that, not only have these areas been neglected by criminology until relatively recently, but the artificial conceptual boundaries which have been drawn between different types of offending are an impediment to a full understanding of the nature of the problem and therefore of the means to address it. New criminological approaches demand a much more comprehensive analysis and one which explores the connections between different types of criminal activities in a way which has not been attempted in the past.

## 2. Themes and Debates in the study of Human Trafficking and Corruption

Although this linkage is becoming more and more evident, academic discussion in the areas of both human trafficking and corruption have until recently been conducted in almost complete isolation from each other. What is evident; however is that these debates, although carried on by different scholars writing in different journals and attending different academic events, have nevertheless shown striking similarities and these points the way forward to establishing a more holistic approach. In both areas, there has been concern with a number of remarkably familiar key themes. These include the relationship of the offending in each case with organised crime, issues of gender and human rights and the functionality of the respective criminal activity for the global market. In order to draw out these parallels it will be helpful to review briefly the leading debates in both subject areas in relation to these topics.

Human trafficking has been so strongly associated with the activities of organised crime that the terms have been described as “interchangeable” (Picarelli 2005, p.115) and trafficking has been seen as one of the primary organised crime activities (Fionda 2012). Burke has claimed that this kind of trafficking has been associated with transnational organised crime groups, small-organised criminal networks and local gangs involved in violations of labour and immigration laws, and government corruption (2017, p.4) and Picarelli has proposed a typology of different organised crime organisations ranging from *ad hoc* groups of entrepreneurial individuals to large-scale international groups (2005, p.116). Their involvement in human trafficking includes the provision of falsified documents, transport and accommodation in a destination country. Crucially, this involvement may also extend to the control of victims during the exploitation stage, particularly in the sex industry (Campana 2015, pp.69-70). A close association with organised crime is similarly reflected in discussions of corruption and one of the leading scholars in the area, Rose-Ackerman has noted the “strong symbiotic relationship” between corruption and organised crime (2018, p.77). Moreover, Huisman and Vande Walle have described organised crime as “the most important domain in criminology for research into corruption” (2010, p.116). In particular, money laundering and the corruption of state officials can be considered as essential mechanisms used by criminal organisations to facilitate both the practice of lucrative illegal activities, such as human trafficking and the avoidance of detection. Human trafficking and corruption can therefore be seen as activities which are inextricably linked in the context of organised crime.

A second significant dimension in the study of both forms of offending, has been their gendered nature. Human trafficking has been traditionally and conceptually conflated with prostitution and illegal migration, and more recently with the commercial sexual exploitation of children (Ruchti 2017). Sexual exploitation invites the most attention as it generates the highest profits and attracts the most sensational media reporting (Belser 2005, pp.12-15), notwithstanding that human trafficking also extends to a wide range of other forms of exploitation. This area has provided fertile ground for radical feminist lobbyists, who, not unreasonably, consider prostitution to be coercive by definition and thus a matter of slavery. Trafficking and prostitution are intrinsically linked in this “sexual domination discourse” and women who migrate and who subsequently become involved in the sex industry are perceived to be victims of trafficking *per se* (Breuil, Siegel et al. 2011, p.33). An alternative view, the so-called “sex work” approach (Sullivan 2003, pp.71-3; Marinova and James 2012, p.232) considers prostitution as a legitimate profession and not as a social problem. From this point of view, trafficking in human beings for the sex industry is considered as a form of labour migration (Breuil, Siegel et al. 2011, p.33). Whichever approach is adopted, trafficking in human beings is inevitably regarded as a problem closely related to prostitution and the exploitation of women.

There is also overwhelming evidence to suggest that the negative impacts of corruption, just as with human trafficking, fall most heavily on women (Seppänen and Virtanen 2007). A considerable body of

research suggests that corruption has characteristics which are gender-related and in addition, promote the exploitation of women (Lindberg and Stensöta 2018). Swamy *et al* (2001) found that in hypothetical situations, women were less likely to condone corruption and, women managers were less involved in bribery. Their work also confirmed findings by Dollar *et al* (2001) that countries which had more women in government had lower levels of corruption although subsequent studies have suggested that the presence of women in government is evidence of a liberal approach which would also be reflected in levels of corruption, without there necessarily being any causal relationship (Sung 2003). Alhassan-Alolo (2007) has further doubted whether women would be able to resist corruption if exposed, as men are, to environments characterised by corrupt opportunities and. However, the exclusion of women from closed male networks may well be one of the reasons for their corruption in the first place since general offending rates for women are much lower than for men (Bjarnegård 2013). Other commentators have suggested that the routes to power may be very different for women, and as a result they may be more reliant on their civil society background and hence less likely to exploit their authority for personal benefit (Grimes and Wängnerud 2010). There is also considerable evidence suggesting that women in developed countries such as Australia are less tolerant of bribery than men (Alatas, Cameron et al. 2009) and less likely to be involved in tax fraud (Torgler and Valev 2010).

A third area which has attracted the attention of scholars working in both fields, is that of human rights. For example, as a result of fierce lobbying by NGOs and civil society groups, trafficking in human beings is increasingly reframed as a human rights issue (Breuil, Siegel et al. 2011, p.34). In this approach, such trafficking is seen as a mechanism for depriving women, children and men (Meçe 2016, p.25) of their human rights, treating them as commodities and using and reusing them so that they can be sold several times, with devastating consequences for victims (ibid). In this context, human trafficking cannot be simply reduced to a mere problem related to migration, a public order concern or an organized crime attempt (ibid). Human rights advocates have gone further in criticizing aggressive enforcement, arguing that states may use trafficking in an effort to put a human face to tough enforcement and justify racist immigration control (Marinova and James 2012, p.232). Human rights activists similarly argue that tolerance of corruption by states results in breaches of human rights (Pearson 2001, p.30). The catastrophic effects of corruption in this area have been addressed by scholars such as Mauro (1995), Brunetti and Weder (1997) and Mo (2001) who observed gravely negative impacts of corruption on governance and the rule of law. Fighting corruption was seen as necessary for the establishment of fundamental human rights, the rule of law, the strengthening of institutions, political participation and the health of civil society and democracy (Ruzindana 1997). Some scholars have, however, taken a different view. Although Goodwin and Rose-Sender acknowledge the harm that corruption poses, they claim that, “corruption is not as straightforward a social evil as the anti-corruption crusaders would have us believe” (Rose-Sender and Goodwin 2010, n.206). They argue that the move to connect corruption and human rights is an extension of the anti-corruption movement and largely influenced by ideology. In essence, it is a form of neo-imperialism (ibid, p.240). Just as the suppression of irregular migration is seen by many scholars as penalising the life chances of people in the developing world, so too the colonisation of development discussions by human rights is equally counterproductive for the real interests of the people concerned (ibid).

The final common area of study relates to the economic realities of both practices and the relationship – and in some cases, the supposed functionality – of human trafficking and corruption for the global market. Barner, Okech and Camp (2014), for example, have discussed human trafficking within the framework of socio-economic inequality, emphasising that it is one of the most serious outcomes of inequality derived from unequal global power relations. Salt and Stein have interpreted human trafficking as an international business, exploring the ‘systematic organization’ and *modus operandi* of the actors involved (Campana 2015, p.69). Here, traffickers are seen to prey on deeply impoverished migrants who move from poor countries to places of economic opportunity (Molland 2010, p.834). In

Europe, as Gallagher puts it, the fall of communism created a market that brought traffickers and smugglers together with huge numbers of individuals who sought to move for a better life (2006, p.166). More recent events in the Middle East have produced an even greater tide of displaced humanity vulnerable to such exploitation (Achilli 2017; Campana 2017). The weapons of fear and violence-based coercion for the purposes of economic gain are the primary characteristics of this phenomenon (Ruchti 2017) and individuals become financially dependent on their exploiter (Koettl 2009, p.7). Many scholars working in this area have sought called for the implementation of strategies that reduce social and economic inequality as a means of combating human trafficking (Meçe 2016, p.25).

Those adopting similar economic perspectives on corruption claim that exploitation within the system is also the dynamic of this type of offending (Jiang 2017, p.25). From this point of view, an incomplete and obstructed market is the real culprit. They argue that fair exchange and equal competition in a genuine market would prevent corrupt acts (ibid, p.24). From the neo-liberal point of view, ‘anti-corruptionism’ – like anti-trafficking, arose from a desire to locate development failure with third world governments and protect the new economic orthodoxy from criticism (Rose-Sender and Goodwin 2010, p.231). This approach, however, fails to address the dynamics of private sector corruption, the significance of the involvement of major transnational corporations and their representatives in determining regulatory environments across the globe or the impacts of the continued intertwining of state and private spheres (Brown and Cloke 2011, p.118). Overall, the mainstream literature on corruption continues to give the distinct impression that it is easier to attempt to “deal with” corruption if it is something that can be tightly defined and reduced to a set of technical challenges and difficulties that can be addressed via the development of new institutions, the steering through of appropriate administrative reforms or simply reducing the size of the state sector (ibid., p.119).

The functionality of corruption for the global market and the process of development has also been the subject of intense debate. Just as some commentators in the area of human trafficking have argued that it is counterproductive to criminalise migration when it is essential for the reproduction of the global labour market (Castles 2011) and (Mahmoud and Trebesch, 2010), so similar arguments have been raised in respect of corruption. Since the 1970s a number of economists have claimed that certain types of corruption could be beneficial to society and could be seen as a positive signal of a society’s evolution towards modernisation (Gathii 2009, pp.134-137). Bardhan (1997) claimed that corruption favours development by allowing entrepreneurs to evolve from bribers. Beck and Maher (1986) and Lien (1986) argued that corruption may actually raise efficiency. The most well-known justification of the beneficial impact of corruption was offered by Leff (1964), Huntington (1968) and Leys (1965) who suggested that corruption may be beneficial in a second-best world because of the distortions caused by the ill-functioning of bureaucracy. In particular, Huntington has argued that there was a functional link between corruption and modernisation because corruption integrates new groups of economic actors into the political process dominated by those who already held power (1968, p.69).

### 3. Criminological Perspectives on Human Trafficking and Corruption

The increasing focus on both human trafficking and corruption is one outcome of important recent changes in the criminological landscape. In the past, transnational crimes such as people trafficking, if they were studied at all, were seen as merely the pains of “modernisation” or the “development” of

the so-called “third world”, which would inevitably follow a similar trajectory to that experienced by the developed world (Clinard and Abbott 1973, p.117). This approach was subjected to trenchant criticism at the time (Sumner 1982) and criminological attempts to address transnational forms of criminality such as people trafficking, all but disappeared from the agenda (Blaustein, Pino et al. 2018, p.214). In a similar way, “economic” crime such as corruption suffered an equal decline in academic interest at the same period (Leigh 1980). This situation was to change dramatically in the early years of the twenty-first century. After a long period of rather unproductive concern with western punitivism and neoliberalism (Matthews 2017, pp.581-583), criminological thought began to invigorate itself through a renewed engagement with, amongst other new subject matters, relations with the global south (Carrington, Hogg et al. 2016; Hogg, Scott et al. 2017). This new research focus was described by Matthews as “probably the most significant theoretical development in the recent period” ((2017, p.581). One of the most important outcomes was the creation of “global” and “transnational” variants of criminology. According to Bowling:

“transnational criminology aims to study the linkages between places, and global criminology aspires to bring together transnational and comparative research from all regions of the world to build a globally inclusive and cosmopolitan discipline.”(2011, p.362)

Crimes with a transnational character and crimes of the powerful, particularly those perpetrated on the global south and those which engaged “the criminology of mobility” (Pickering, Bosworth et al. 2015) began to assume increased importance. As a result, the last two decades have witnessed the translation of both people trafficking and corruption from the periphery of academic and international institutional concern to the very centre of attention. This parallel rise to ascendancy in global awareness of these two types of offending is no coincidence and reflects the fact that, linked as they are in operation, they are both crimes which flourish in a globalised market. According to Findlay, postcolonial globalisation generates renewed opportunities for corruption through the “marketization of fragile and vulnerable emergent economies in a voracious world climate of free trade” (2018, p.385). Equally, the rise of the human trafficking phenomenon has been linked to the penetration of the global market into the rural south and the insatiable demands of metropolitan economies for cheap labour. In a sense, therefore, they both represent symptoms of the expansion of the globalised market.

Another important dimension linking these two forms of offending in contemporary criminological debates is their tendency to blur the distinction between the legal and the illegal. Palidda has noted how organised crime has flourished in economies where the legal and the illegal rely on each other and constantly morph into each other; a process which he calls “hybridization.” (2013). Kubal (2013) has noted that irregular immigration is conducted in the world of the “semi-legal”. Human trafficking and corruption both seem to occupy the penumbral space between the upper world and lower world. No longer are they seen as the activities of a distinct and separate sphere of organised criminality or “alien conspiracy” (Huisman and Vande Walle 2010, p.117) but as intersecting with the world of legality and normality at each stage (Fijnaut and Paoli 2006, pp.318-320; Gurciullo 2014). To move people illegally to a workplace destination requires considerable organisation and preparation and the assistance, corrupted or otherwise, of a great many individuals in the areas of accommodation, transport and documentation, not to mention in the destination labour market (Crane 2013; Mehra and Shay 2016). Funds generated through trafficking must be laundered and re-invested and to achieve all this, strategic alliances must be made with state and other agencies.(Cockayne 2016). All these activities connect the world of the legal with the illegal and bring together activities of human trafficking and corruption in a mutual, self-facilitating network.



As a result, it is argued here that both forms of offending must be analysed in terms of networks which straddle the legitimate and illegitimate economies. Social network analysis has taken a dominant position in criminological research in recent years (Papachristos 2011; Bouchard and Malm 2016; Campana 2016) and nowhere more so than in the approach to organised crime (McIlwain 1999; van Dijk and Spapens 2014). This is evident in both the areas of people trafficking (Mancuso 2014; Campana 2015) and corruption (Fazekas, Skuhrovec et al. 2017; Jackson, Rogers et al. 2017), where this approach is making a substantial contribution to our understanding, particularly of the relationship between the upper and lower worlds. It is therefore no longer possible to address the problem of crime, and in particular transnational crime, as if it consisted of a number of entirely separate offending activities which could be studied in isolation. The global perspective on criminology demands a much more holistic approach, where related crimes such as people trafficking and corruption, which complement and sustain each other in a complex interrelationship, are viewed as aspects of a network. Not only does this approach more accurately reflect the realities of the crime threats facing us but it also offers the opportunity for more sophisticated and effective policing strategies.

#### 4. The Need for a holistic response

Police forces represent the most important front line resources in the fight against human trafficking, not only enabling criminal networks to be dismantled but participants to be prosecuted, their assets seized and their victims protected. Recent studies by INTERPOL have demonstrated that trafficking networks have become professional, entrepreneurial and less visible. This new level of professionalism in the trafficking networks (Arsovska and Janssens 2009, p. 170) and also its engagement with corruption, requires effective, multi-faceted and well-coordinated police work. .

Traffickers adjust quickly to tactics used by police; tend to deceive the police, keep a low profile and attract little attention, often using legal companies as a front for their illegal activities, which makes the work of law enforcement officials more difficult. This can be more complex when some traffickers deal not only in people but also in drugs, weapons, and other goods. The criminal use of cash and underground banking and the lack of police collaboration with specialists in this field, make financial investigations, the seizure of assets, the confiscations of proceeds of crime and the investigation of crime scenes challenging for police. In addition, police officials need to cooperate with immigration officers, social workers, labour inspectors, prosecutors, judges, victim shelters and others concerned with ensuring successful prosecution.

It has been the argument of this chapter that the offences of people trafficking and corruption need to be addressed together and therefore a multi-agency approach is the only means by which enforcement officials will be able to call upon the wide range of skills necessary to address the problem of networked offending. This has to be done by a combination of police and victim support providers, financial anti-corruption specialists, NGOs and policy-makers who can share their knowledge in order to identify high-risk sectors vulnerable to trafficking-related corruption, vulnerable communities, human traffickers, trafficking methods, and trafficking networks. In this mapping exercise, multiple sources should be involved, such as; financial intelligence units, police records, victims' statements, the experiences of social workers, migration officers and representatives from NGOs (Arsovska 2008, p.55). Financial intelligence strategies should be also applied to map trafficking networks' interactions with corrupt officials and to disrupt reinvestment of trafficking proceeds into criminal trafficking networks. (OECD 2014, p. 27).



The mandates of existing anti-corruption agencies should include a focus on trafficking-related corruption. Specialised multi-agency units and multi-agency training regimes should be established with anti-corruption and anti-trafficking experts. An anti-corruption agency could investigate corruption cases; cooperate with prosecutors to bring criminal cases; raise public awareness of the problem; and facilitate interagency cooperation including security, law enforcement, and financial/bank institutions. (IBA 2016, p, 42). Trafficking investigations and prosecutions should run alongside investigations into corruption and finances of suspects. (OECD 2014, p. 27). Criminal intelligence services as the lead investigation agency for the fight against transnational organised crime, use crime analysis and criminal intelligence in a strategic manner to determine offenders for targeting (Schreier 2009, p. 234). On the other hand, financial investigations can serve both evidentiary and pragmatic purposes. They may lead to evidence supporting additional defendants or additional charges, such as money laundering or financial fraud. Financial information can also serve to corroborate a victim's or witness's statement, thus enhancing credibility. Financial investigations can also lead to the discovery of assets (Jernow, 2009, p. 344).

The co-operation of anti-trafficking and anti-corruption enforcement officials and the use of a combination of punitive and responsabilisation strategies offers important new opportunities in the fight against both these types of offending. The response to crime should not merely sought from the traditional control agencies, such as the police or prosecution authorities but extends to a wide range of institutions in civil society, including in the private sector (Fouladvand, 2018). Given the complex interconnections between legitimate industries and the illicit economy of trafficking and given the huge profits generated by this activity, it is no longer possible to maintain that a prosecution strategy alone can be successful. In a holistic approach to the struggle against trafficking, individuals, local authorities and private enterprises of all sizes must all be held accountable. Garland has described this as a 'responsibilization strategy' which is an important trend in crime control but, importantly, one that exists alongside the growth of an increasingly punitive state (Ibid.,). The greatest vulnerability for organised crime, in many respects its Achilles heel, is the need to engage at certain critical points with the legitimate economy, whether through corrupting officials or by laundering funds. The potential for enforcement agencies to exploit these vulnerabilities is only just beginning to be fully realised.

## Conclusion

The aim of this chapter has been to suggest that we have reached a critical moment in the response to some of the most challenging offending which disfigures the contemporary global era. For the first time it has proved possible to demonstrate unequivocally the linkages which connect corruption and people trafficking, while the networks which sustain them both are at last beginning to be more apparent in the light thrown by an increasing body of research. It is time for the two areas of study, with their many similar themes, to be brought together, especially now that criminological theory has moved decisively away from the narrow parochialism which has characterised so much twentieth century research and has begun to address the broader crime threats which arise in an international market so heavily weighted against the interests of the global south. This is not to say that the circuits of international organised crime begin and end with people trafficking and corruption. On the contrary, the holistic approaches described here also offer the tempting prospect of understanding the interrelationship of these activities with other offending, most notably drug and arms trafficking and the colonisation of the dark web by criminal interests. Most importantly, the juxtaposition of these offences demonstrates effectively how close are the connections between the under and upper worlds; between criminality and the everyday.

This new scholarly and research interest described above is important only if it drives and facilitates new approaches to the detection, prevention and prosecution of these linked offences. The final section of this chapter has sought to demonstrate the importance of new approaches, based on the

available research, which call for a more connected policing strategy and the use of a wider range of legal and procedural instruments to “responsibilise” civil society; the consumers of tainted products and the money markets which launder the proceeds. Just as scholars have for the first time begun to dissolve the interdisciplinary barriers which divide the study of one offence from another and one region from another, so law enforcement needs to follow. A networked approach to analysis and to crime control is the only reasonable response to a networked web of offending.

## Reference List

- ACHILLI, L. (2017). Smuggling and Trafficking in Human Beings at the Time of the Syrian conflict. Human Trafficking and Exploitation. Abingdon, Routledge Academic: 129-146.
- ARSOVSKA, J. (2008). Decline, Change or Denial: Human Trafficking Activities and EU Responses in the Balkan Triangle, Policing 2, no.1 pp. 50–63.
- ARSOVSKA, J. and JANSSENS, S. (2009). Human Trafficking & Policing: Good & Bad Practices in Strategies Against Human Trafficking: The Role of the Security Sector ed. Cornelius Friesendorf. Study Group Information, Vienna.
- AGBU, O. (2003). Corruption and Human Trafficking: The Nigerian Case. 4(1) West Africa Review, pp.1-13.
- ALATAS, V., CAMERON, L., CHAUDHURI, A., ERKAL, N. & GANGADHARAN, L. (2009). Gender, Culture, and Corruption: Insights from an Experimental Analysis. 75(3) Southern Economic Journal, pp.663-680.
- ALHASSAN-ALOLO, N. (2007). Gender and Corruption: Testing the New Consensus. 27(3) Public Administration and Development, pp.227-237.
- BALES, K. (2005). Understanding Global Slavery: A Reader. Berkeley, University of California Press.
- BARDHAN, P. (1997). Corruption and Development: A Review of Issues. 35(3) Journal of Economic Literature, pp.1320-1346.
- BARNER, J., OKECH, D. & CAMP, M. (2014). Socio-Economic Inequality, Human Trafficking, and the Global Slave Trade. 4(2) Societies, pp.148-160.
- BECK, P. J. & MAHER, M. W. (1986). A Comparison of Bribery and Bidding in Thin Markets. 20(1) Economics letters, pp.1-5.
- BELSER, P. (2005). Forced Labour and Human Trafficking: Estimating the Profits. Geneva, International Labour Organization.
- BJARNEGÅRD, E. (2013). Gender, Informal Institutions and Political Recruitment: Explaining Male Dominance in Parliamentary Representation. New York, Palgrave Macmillan.
- BLAUSTEIN, J., PINO, N. W. & ELLISON, G. (2018). Crime and Development in the Global South K. Carrington, R. Hogg, J. Scott and M. Sozzo. The Palgrave Handbook of Criminology and the Global South. Cham, Palgrave Macmillan: 205-222.

BOUCHARD, M. & MALM, A. (2016). Social Network Analysis and Its Contribution to Research on Crime and Criminal Justice. Pre-Publication. Oxford, Oxford University Press.

BOWLING, B. (2011). Transnational Criminology and the Globalization of Harm Production. C. Hoyle and M. Bosworth. What is Criminology. Oxford, OUP: 361-379.

BREUIL, B. C. O., SIEGEL, D., VAN REENEN, P., BEIJER, A. & ROOS, L. (2011). Human Trafficking Revisited: Legal, Enforcement and Ethnographic Narratives on Sex Trafficking to Western Europe. 14(1) Trends in Organized Crime, pp.30-46.

BROWN, E. & CLOKE, J. (2011). Critical Perspectives on Corruption: An Overview. 7(2) Critical Perspectives on International Business, pp.116-124.

BRUNETTI, A. & WEDER, B. (1997). Investment and Institutional Uncertainty: A Comparative Study of Different Uncertainty Measures. Washington, World Bank Publications.

BURKE, M. C. (2017). Human Trafficking: Interdisciplinary Perspectives. Abingdon, Routledge.

CAMPANA, P. (2015). The Structure of Human Trafficking: Lifting the Bonnet on a Nigerian Transnational Network. 56(1) British Journal of Criminology, pp.68-86.

CAMPANA, P. (2016). Explaining Criminal Networks: Strategies and Potential Pitfalls. 9 Methodological Innovations.

CAMPANA, P. (2017). The Market for Human Smuggling into Europe: A Macro Perspective. 11(4) Policing: A Journal of Policy and Practice, pp.448-456.

CARRINGTON, K., HOGG, R. & SOZZO, M. (2016). Southern Criminology. 56(1) The British Journal of Criminology, pp.1-20.

Castles, S. (2011). "Migration, Crisis, and the Global Labour Market." Globalizations 8(3): 311-324.

Centre for the Study of Democracy (CSD) (2010). The study to examine the links between organised Crime and Corruption. The European Commission.

CLINARD, M. & ABBOTT, D. (1973). Crime in Developing Countries: A Comparative Perspective. New York, Wiley.

COCKAYNE, J. (2016). Hidden Power: the Strategic Logic of Organized Crime. Oxford, OUP.

CRANE, A. (2013). Modern Slavery as a Management Practice: Exploring the Conditions and Capabilities for Human Exploitation. 38(1) Academy of Management Review, pp.49-69.

DEMAS, R. R. (2008). All Hands on Deck: Collaborative Global Strategies in the Battle Against Corruption and Human Trafficking in Africa. 6(1) University of St Thomas Law Journal, pp.204-220.

DOLLAR, D., FISMAN, R. & GATTI, R. (2001). Are Women Really the “Fairer” Sex? Corruption and Women in Government. 46(4) Journal of Economic Behavior & Organization, pp.423-429.

FAZEKAS, M., SKUHROVEC, J. & WACHS, J. (2017). Corruption, Government Turnover, and Public Contracting Market Structure – Insights Using Network Analysis and Objective Corruption Proxies. Budapest, Budapest: Government Transparency Institute.

FIJNAUT, C. & PAOLI, L. (2006). Organised Crime and its Control Policies. 14(3) European Journal of Crime, Criminal Law and Criminal Justice, pp.307-327.

FINDLAY, M. (2018). Trading Corruption North/South. K. Carrington, R. Hogg, J. Scott and M. Sozzo. The Palgrave Handbook of Criminology and the Global South. Cham, Palgrave Macmillan: 369-390.

FIONDA, D. (2012). Organised Crime and Trafficking in Persons. 436 Trends & Issues in Crime and Criminal Justice, pp.1-12.

FOULADVAND, S. (2018). Decentering the prosecution-oriented approach: tackling both supply and demand in the struggle against human trafficking. International Journal of Law, Crime and Justice, 52. pp. 129-143.

GARLAND, D. (2001). The Culture of Control: Crime and Social Order in Contemporary Society, (Oxford, Oxford University Press), p.124.

GALLAGHER, A. (2006). Recent Legal Developments in the Field of Human Trafficking: A Critical Review of the 2005 European Convention and Related Instruments. 8(2) European Journal of Migration and Law, pp.163-189.

GATHII, J. T. (2009). Defining The Relationship Between Human Rights and Corruption. 31(1) University of Pennsylvania Journal of International Law, pp.125-202.

GOUNEV, P. & RUGGIERO, V. (2012). Corruption and Organized Crime in Europe: Illegal Partnerships. Abingdon, Routledge.

GRIMES, M. & WÄNGNERUD, L. (2010). Curbing Corruption Through Social Welfare Reform? The Effects of Mexico’s Conditional Cash Transfer Program on Good Government. 40(6) The American Review of Public Administration, pp.671-690.

GURCIULLO, S. (2014). Organised Crime Infiltration in the Legitimate Private Economy-An Empirical Network Analysis Approach. International Crime and Intelligence Analysis Conference. Manchester.

HOGG, R., SCOTT, J. & SOZZO, M. (2017). Southern Criminology: Guest Editors' Introduction. 6(1) International Journal for Crime, Justice and Social Democracy, pp.1-7.

HOLMES, L. (2005). Human Trafficking and Corruption: Triple Victimization? C. Freisendorf. Strategies Against Trafficking: The Role of Security Sector. Strasbourg, European Commission: 83-114.

HUGHES, D. M. 2004. "The Role Of 'Marriage Agencies' In the Sexual Exploitation and Trafficking of Women from the Former Soviet Union." International Review of Victimology 11.

HUISMAN, W. & VANDE WALLE, G. (2010). The Criminology of Corruption. The Good Cause : Theoretical Perspectives on Corruption. G. d. Graaf and P. v. Maravic. Opladen, B. Budrich: 115-145.

HUNTINGTON, S. P. (1968). Political Order in Changing Societies. Newhaven, Yale University Press.

INTERNATIONAL BAR ASSOCIATION (2016). Human Trafficking and Public Corruption. A report by the IBA's Presidential Task Force Against Human Trafficking. London, International Bar Association.

JACKSON, M. O., ROGERS, B. W. & ZENOU, Y. (2017). The Economic Consequences of Social-Network Structure. . 55(1) Journal of Economic Literature, pp.49-95.

JERNOW, A. (2009). Human Trafficking, Prosecutors & Judges in Strategies Against Human Trafficking: The Role of the Security Sector ed. Cornelius Friesendorf. Study Group Information, Vienna.

JIANG, G. (2017). Corruption Control in Post-Reform China: A Social Censure Perspective. Singapore, Springer.

JONSSON, S. (2018). The Complex Relationship between Police Corruption and Sex Trafficking in Origin Countries. Journal of Human Trafficking, pp.1-21.

KOETTL, J. (2009). Human Trafficking, Modern Day Slavery, and Economic Exploitation. Washington, The World Bank.

KUBAL, A. (2013). Conceptualizing Semi-Legality in Migration Research. 47(3) Law & Society Review, pp.555-587.

LEFF, N. H. (1964). Economic Development Through Bureaucratic Corruption. 8(3) American Behavioral Scientist, pp.8-14.

LEIGH, L. H., and Conference on Economic Crime. Economic Crime in Europe. New York: St. Martin's P., 1980.

LEMAN, J. & JANSSENS, S. (2012). Albanian Entrepreneurial Practices in Human Smuggling and Trafficking: On The Road to the United Kingdom Via Brussels, 1995–2005. 50(6) International Migration, pp.166-179.

LEYS, C. (1965). What is the Problem about Corruption? 3(2) The Journal of Modern African Studies, pp.215-230.

LIEN, D.-H. D. (1986). A Note on Competitive Bribery Games. 22(4) Economics Letters, pp.337-341.

LINDBERG, H. & STENSÖTA, H. (2018). Corruption as Exploitation: Feminist Exchange Theories and the Link Between Gender and Corruption. H. Stensöta and L. Wängnerud. Gender and Corruption. Historical Roots and New Avenues for Research, Springer: 237-256.

LYDAY, C. B. (2001). The Shadow Market in Human Beings: An Anti-Corruption Perspective. Transparency International's 10th International Anti-Corruption Conference, Prague, Czech Republic, October.

MAHMOUD, T., TREBESCH, C., 2010. The economics of human trafficking and labour migration: micro-evidence from Eastern Europe. Journal of Comparative Economics 38 (2), 173–188.

MANCUSO, M. (2014). Not all Madams have a Central Role: Analysis of a Nigerian sex Trafficking Network. 17(1-2) Trends in Organized Crime, pp.66-88.

MARINOVA, N. K. & JAMES, P. (2012). The Tragedy of Human Trafficking: Competing Theories and European Evidence. 8(3) Foreign Policy Analysis, pp.231-253.

MATTHEWS, R. (2017). False Starts, Wrong Turns and Dead Ends: Reflections on Recent Developments in Criminology. 25(4) Critical Criminology, pp..577-591.

MAURO, P. (1995). Corruption and Growth. 110(3) The Quarterly Journal of Economics, pp.681-712.

MCILLWAIN, J. S. (1999). Organized Crime: A Social Network Approach. 32(4) Crime, Law and Social Change, pp.301-323.

MEÇE, M. H. (2016). Effectiveness of Counter-Trafficking Response in Albania. 14(1) Social Change Review, pp.25-46.

MEHRA, A. & SHAY, K. (2016). Corporate Responsibility and Accountability for Modern Forms of Slavery. 14(2) Journal of International Criminal Justice.

MO, P. H. (2001). Corruption and Economic Growth. 29(1) Journal of Comparative Economics, pp.66-79.

MOLLAND, S. (2010). 'The Perfect Business': Human Trafficking and Lao–Thai Cross-Border Migration. 41(5) Development and Change, pp.831-855.

OECD (2016). Trafficking in Persons and Corruption. Breaking the Chain. Paris, OECD Publishing.



OECD (2014). 'Developing a Framework for Combatting Corruption Related to Trafficking in Persons' Background Paper, pp. 10-11.

OECD (2015). Ending Human Trafficking: Building a Better World and Partnerships for Sustainable Security and Human Dignity. Cebu, Philippines.

PACO (2002). Corruption and Organised Crime, Report on the Regional Seminar (Portoroz).

PALIDDA, S. (2013). Re-Hybridizing the Legal and the Criminal in All Activities at the Local, National and Global Level: a 'Political Total Fact' in the 21st Century Neoliberal Frame. P. S. Saitta, S. and V. A. Getting By or Getting Rich? The Formal, Informal and Criminal Economy in a Globalized World. The Hague, Eleven Publishing International: 30-50.

PAPACHRISTOS, A. V. (2011). The Coming of a Networked Criminology. J. Macdonald. Measuring Crime and Criminality. Advances in Criminological Theory. Transaction, New Brunswick. 17: 101-140.

PEARSON, Z. (2001). An International Human Rights Approach to Corruption. Corruption and Anti-Corruption, pp.30-61.

PICARELLI, J. (2005). Human Trafficking and Organised Crime in the US and Western Europe. C. Freisendorf. Strategies Against Trafficking: The Role of Security Sector. Strasbourg, European Commission: 115-136.

PICKERING, S., BOSWORTH, M. & AAS, K. F. (2015). The Criminology of Mobility. S. Pickering and J. Ham. The Routledge Handbook on Crime and International Migration. London, Routledge: 382-396.

RICHARDS, K. (2004). The trafficking of migrant workers: What are the links between labour trafficking and corruption? International Migration, 42 (5): 147-168.

ROSE-ACKERMAN, S. & PALIFKA, B. J. (2018). Corruption, Organized Crime, and Money Laundering. Institutions, Governance and the Control of Corruption, Springer: 75-111.

ROSE-SENDER, S. K. & GOODWIN, M. (2010). Linking Corruption and Human Rights: An Unwelcome Addition to the Development Discourse. M. Boersma and H. Nelen. Corruption and Human Rights: Interdisciplinary Perspectives. Antwerp, Intersentia: 221-240.

RUCHTI, L. (2017). Fear, Fraud and Frank Complexities: The Influence of Gender on Human Trafficking. M. C. Burke. Human Trafficking: Interdisciplinary Perspectives. Abingdon, Routledge: pp.88-108.

RUZINDANA, A. (1997). The Importance of Leadership in Fighting Corruption in Uganda. Corruption and the Global Economy, pp.133-145.

SAKDIYAKORN, M. & VICHITRANANDA, S. (2010). Corruption, Human Trafficking and Human Rights: The Case of Forced Labor and Sexual Exploitation in Thailand. 3(1) NACC Journal, pp.54-66.

SCHREIER, F. (2009). Human Trafficking, Organised Crime & Intelligence in Strategies Against Human Trafficking: The Role of the Security Sector ed. Cornelius Friesendorf. Study Group Information, Vienna.

SEPPÄNEN, M. & VIRTANEN, P. (2007). Corruption, Poverty and Gender. With Case Studies of Nicaragua and Tanzania. Helsinki, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Finland.

SKOGAN, W. and Hartnett, S. Community Policing, Chicago Style (New York: Oxford University Press, 1997).

STUDNICKA, A. C. S. (2010). Corruption and Human Trafficking in Brazil: Findings from a Multi-Modal Approach. 7(1) European Journal of Criminology, pp.29-43.

SULLIVAN, B. (2003). Trafficking in Women. 5(1) International Feminist Journal of Politics, pp.67-91.

SUMNER, C. (1982). Crime, Justice and Underdevelopment. London, Heinemann.

SUNG, H.-E. (2003). Fairer Sex or Fairer System? Gender and Corruption Revisited. 82(2) Social Forces, pp.703-723.

SWAMY, A., KNACK, S., LEE, Y. & AZFAR, O. (2001). Gender and corruption. 64(1) Journal of development economics, pp.25-55.

TORGLER, B. & VALEV, N. T. (2010). Gender And Public Attitudes Toward Corruption And Tax Evasion. 28(4) Contemporary Economic Policy, pp.554-568.

UDDIN, M. B. (2014). Human Trafficking in South Asia: Issues of Corruption and Human Security. 2(1) International Journal of Social Work and Human Services Practice, pp.18-27.

UNODC (2011). Issue Paper. The Role of Corruption in Trafficking in Persons Vienna, United Nations.

UNODC (2009). The Role of Corruption in Trafficking in Persons at the Third Session of the Conference of State Parties to the United Nations Convention against Corruption (09-13 November 2009) Doha, p.17.

UNODC (2006). *Toolkit to Combat Trafficking in Persons* (Vienna: United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime), Tool 5.2.

UNODC (2006). *Toolkit to Combat Trafficking in Persons* (Vienna: United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime), Tool 5.5.

VAN DIJK, J. & KLERX-VAN MIERLO, F. (2011). Indicators of Corruption: Further Explorations of the Link Between Corruption and Implementation Failure in Anti-Trafficking Policies. Tilburg: International Victimology Institute Working paper.

VAN DIJK, J. & SPAPENS, T. (2014). Transnational Organized Crime Networks. P. Reichel and J. Albanese. Handbook of Transnational Crime and Justice. Thousand Oaks, Sage: 213-226.

VANDENBERG, M. (2002). Complicity, Corruption, and Human Rights: Trafficking in Human Beings. 34(3) Case Western Reserve Journal of International Law, pp.323-333.

VÄYRYNEN, R. (2003). Illegal immigration, human trafficking, and organized crime. Helsinki, UNU-WIDER.

ZHANG, S. X. & PINEDA, S. L. (2008). Corruption as a Causal Factor in Human Trafficking. D. Siegel and H. Nelen. Organized Crime: Culture, Markets and Policies. New York, Springer: 41-55.